Date: March 20, 2012

Program/Service Information

Tutoring
The Tutoring Program provides tutoring and academic support for a wide number of academic courses. The service is free for all currently-enrolled College of Marin students who are taking credit courses or noncredit ESL courses. Each semester, the program employs between 35-45 faculty-recommended peer tutors who receive training in an initial seminar, as well as continuing seminars and workshops, and who receive line-of-sight supervision by a certificated Tutoring Coordinator in keeping with Title 5 regulations, the tutors are compensated based on the part-time hourly district salary scale, receiving $10.75 an hour the first semester with a 50 cent per hour raise each subsequent semester, to a maximum hourly wage of $11.75. Our peer tutors provide thousands of hours of academic support for several hundred students every semester.

The Tutoring Program at College of Marin serves many purposes. The tutors have the opportunity to gain mastery of the subjects they tutor, to learn how to support their fellow students, and to gain working experience while in college. The students who use tutoring services find that academic support helps them to complete their classes successfully, develop effective study habits, gain a deeper understanding of what they are studying, and learn long-term study skills that can help them to be more successful in all of their classes.

Problem/ Needs (i.e. SLO assessment findings, SLO meeting dialogue)

SLO Findings
The Tutoring program measured one division SLO and two program SLOs during the fall 2011 semester.

Div-level SLO: Students will identify and use college resources that support student success.
Prog-level SLO 1: Students will demonstrate a deeper understanding of course materials.
Prog-level SLO 2: Students will apply new knowledge to improve course grades.

Using surveys and qualitative data from tutors, we measured these SLOs. Data showed overwhelmingly that students believe that tutoring helped them:

a) to reach a deeper understanding of course materials (100% agreed or strongly agreed) and
b) to apply their new knowledge to improve their grades (91% agreed or strongly agreed; 8% disagreed – although some commented that they disagreed because they didn't yet know what their final grade in the class would be). Anecdotal data from tutors provided specific examples.

In a department meeting with the area administrator and staff, TLC staff members determined that for those students we surveyed, we were meeting our SLOs. But data from another question in the survey raised other issues that we agreed needed to be addressed.

Staffing
One survey question asked whether the Tutoring Center was adequately staffed to meet students’ needs. Only 7% said it was not, but we realized that our question wasn’t specific to either tutors or classified staff, who assist in meeting students’ needs to schedule, reschedule, and ask for tutoring. Since we are now in the process of increasing our services to students at all locations, and especially to students who take classes...
online, in the evening, and at the IVC campus, there is concern that this percentage will increase if we don’t plan accordingly.

We also looked at an online student survey completed in spring 2010, arguably more accessible to those students who are not receiving adequate tutoring services in the current format. The online survey found that 72% of respondents were either likely or very likely to use tutoring services if available on Saturdays, and in the open comments section nearly every respondent mentioned the need for more hours, more tutors, more courses for which tutoring is available, and especially more evening tutoring.

The Tutoring program currently has the equivalent of 1.0 FTE classified staff member to cover all aspects of the program. An additional half-time position has been temporarily funded through BSI for the last 2 years. The 1.0 FTE has been filled by 2 hourly temporary employees for the past year. All of these factors contribute to our conclusion that the TLC needs more stable funding for staffing. With the expansion of services we are offering and the growth of the program, this lack of adequate and permanent staffing and funding for services is becoming critical.

Program Objectives from 2010 Program Review Update

1) **Become a CRLA certified Tutoring Program**
   We are qualified to become certified now. Increased work load coupled with staffing issues has not allowed it to happen yet.

2) **Re-establish noncredit tutoring course to support college objective of collecting WSCH**
   Title 5 (section 58051) allows colleges to claim ADA apportionment for peer tutoring via a noncredit course. The curriculum for this noncredit course exists; however, we need additional staff time to update the curriculum and send it the Curriculum Committee. Our administrators and staff are investigating various software programs that would allow us to collect this WSCH data by tracking lab usage. There will be a cost associated with purchasing the software as well as staff support time to train tutors and students how to use and maintain it.

3) **Realign program to be legally compliant with Title 5**
   Because the Marin Community College District is a basic aid district, we do not currently collect apportionment for the Tutoring Program. While this relieves us of our legal obligation, it does not relieve us of our professional obligation to run a program in compliance with state law. There are three main areas where we are out of compliance. These issues have continued to be discussed, but have not yet been totally addressed.

   - The CSEA job description for the Tutoring Center Coordinator currently requires a bachelor’s degree. However, according to according to Title 5, section 53415, a master’s degree is required for this position. This is an excerpt from section 53415:

   The minimum qualifications for service as a learning assistance or learning skills coordinator or instructor, or tutoring coordinator, shall be either (a) or (b) below:
   (a) the minimum qualifications to teach any master’s level discipline in which learning assistance or tutoring is provided at the college where the coordinator is employed; or
   (b) a master’s degree in education, educational psychology, or instructional psychology, or other master’s degree with emphasis in adult learning theory. Minimum qualifications do not apply to tutoring or learning assistance for which no apportionment is claimed.

- In order for tutoring to qualify for apportionment through a noncredit course, students must be referred to the program by either a counselor or a faculty member. Currently, the Tutoring Program does not have referral system in place. Section 58170 in Title V describes this requirement:
  Students enroll in the Supervised Tutoring course through registration procedures established pursuant to section 58108 after referral by a counselor or an instructor on the basis of an identified learning need.

*It should be noted that the Statewide Academic Senate is currently reviewing the referral aspect. It is generally agreed within the profession that self-referral should be allowed as well.

4) Obtain data regarding the diversity of the students served by the program
   This data exists, however, without a way to generate a list from students enrolled in the course, it will not be possible to develop an Argos report. Meeting objectives 2 & 3 will make this possible.

5) Increase tutor salary classification to align with market wage for tutors in Marin County
   The highest category on COM’s student hourly salary schedule has a range of $12-$14 per hour. The only students in this category are the student ambassadors. The level of responsibility for the peer tutors is equal to that of the student ambassador position. Both positions require professionalism and modeling of excellent student behavior. Yet the tutors must also enroll in a training course, excel in their subject areas, and develop a fundamental understanding of supporting learning in innovative ways. The tutors play an essential role in helping hundreds of students reach their educational goals each semester, which in turns helps the college by supporting retention. Tutoring remains one of the most cost-effective means for institutions to reach their institutional goals.

   Tutors who work privately in Marin County make between $25 and $100 per hour. In 2010, College of Marin tutors who worked in the afterschool program at Drake High School, a public high school less than 5 miles from COM, made $6 more per hour as compared to their COM salaries. The current wages of $10.75-11.75 per hour for peer tutors is too far below market value to be competitive.

   We will continue to seek partnerships within the college to offset program expenses. Since 2003, we have worked with the Financial Aid Department to maintain our 25% work-study match program. All eligible tutors are paid through Federal work-study funds. Work-study pays 75% of their salary and the Tutoring Program pays 25%.

   The Tutoring Program also has a partnership with the EOPS department. EOPS students are eligible for one hour, per subject, per week of individualized tutoring. The coordinator arranges sessions for as many as 25 EOPS students each semester. All salary expenses from these sessions are carefully tracked. Total costs for EOPS tutoring are calculated at the end of each semester and the Tutoring Program is reimbursed for the salary expenses.

   The budget for the Tutoring Program is carefully monitored throughout the year. Poorly attended sessions are cancelled in a timely fashion, and additional sessions are added based on demonstrated need. Because most of the tutoring is small group tutoring, we have an excellent ratio between cost and service provided. According to payroll data from spring 2008 through fall 2009 (including 2008 and 2009 summer sessions), tutors worked a total of 13,528 hours. During that same time period, students received a total of 23,463 hours of tutoring. This means that on average, students received 1.73 hours of tutoring for every hour a tutor was paid.
A budget increase for tutor salaries would move the position to the proper place on the student hourly salary scale, while allowing us to increase the level of service to IVC, evening, and online students.

6) Implement new technology to streamline tutoring program administration
   This objective is now being worked on as we look into software that will also generate WSCH

7) Pilot online tutoring using CCC Confer
   This objective is currently being met. The platform we are using integrates with Moodle and is free. The only costs associated with providing this service is for equipment to facilitate the service (trackpads for tutors), additional staff time, and additional tutor hours.

Additional Needs - Computers
The computers in the TLC are extensively used for academic work by students and tutors on a daily basis. The computers we have now are more than five years old and continue to have operating system and compliance problems. On many of the machines, we are unable to install updated software because of operating system deficiencies. While the college continues to develop new and updated curriculum that incorporates new software and new delivery methods, we will be unable to provide the learning support necessary without new computers. We have a total of eight computers that would cost approximately $1200 each to replace.

Request for Resources Allocation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District Tutoring Budget Request (ongoing)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$20,000</td>
<td>Full-time student tutor salaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$10,000</td>
<td>Part-time student tutor salaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$1500</td>
<td>Textbooks, supplies and trackpads (for online services)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>$30,500</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Funding Request for Addition of Tutoring Classified Staff (permanent,)

| Tutoring Coordinator (Grade 22, level C) | $60,684 |
| Benefits @ 30%                           | $20,025 |
| **TOTAL**                                | **$80,709.70** |

One-Time Budget Requests

| $9600 | 8 computers for students and tutors |
| **TOTAL** | **$9,600** |

How Resources will Impact the Program

Addition of another permanent staff member as Coordinator, while retaining the current 1.0 FTE position at grade 16 (to provide technical and other support) will allow for proper support of existing services at both campuses as well as new services to online, evening and IVC students. Without additional staffing, we are stretching as far as we can to barely meet these goals, having to short-change KTD tutoring in order to establish a presence at IVC. Research suggests that adding online tutoring will increase student demand even more because tutoring will now be accessible to additional students.
Increasing the tutor salaries will bring our wage somewhat closer to the market wage for tutors in Marin County, and will bring them to the same level as the student ambassadors at the college.

An increase in the supply budget will allow us to purchase the equipment necessary to support online tutoring, purchase textbooks for the tutor library, and purchase additional supplies such as dry-erase markers, etc.

New computers would allow students to utilize the latest software that they are using for their courses, and would reduce the workload on the IT technician.

Responsible Person for Completing this Mini-Program Review

Becky Reetz

Signature of Dean/Supervisor ___________________________ Date ___________________________

Deadline for submission: March 20th
Please submit your Annual Program-Level SLO Report with your Mini-Program Review
1. The hours of the Tutoring Center meet my needs as a student.

1. Strongly Disagree 0 0%
2. Disagree 5 12%
3. Agree 23 55%
4. Strongly Agree 14 33%
Total Responses: 42
Mean: 3.21 Standard Deviation: 0.65

3. The Tutoring Center is in a good location.

1. Strongly Disagree 0 0%
2. Disagree 0 0%
3. Agree 24 56%
4. Strongly Agree 19 44%
Total Responses: 43
Mean: 3.44 Standard Deviation: 0.50

5. The Tutoring Center is adequately staffed to meet my needs.

1. Strongly Disagree 0 0%
2. Disagree 3 7%
3. Agree 25 61%
4. Strongly Agree 13 32%
Total Responses: 41
Mean: 3.24 Standard Deviation: 0.58
7. The tutors I have worked with are knowledgeable about their subject.

- Strongly Disagree: 0% (0 responses)
- Disagree: 0% (0 responses)
- Agree: 48% (20 responses)
- Strongly Agree: 52% (22 responses)

Mean: 3.52  Standard Deviation: 0.51

9. Tutoring helped me to understand the course material better.

- Strongly Disagree: 0% (0 responses)
- Disagree: 0% (0 responses)
- Agree: 44% (19 responses)
- Strongly Agree: 56% (24 responses)

Mean: 3.56  Standard Deviation: 0.50

11. Tutoring helped me to improve my performance on assignments and exams.

- Strongly Disagree: 0% (0 responses)
- Disagree: 5% (2 responses)
- Agree: 42% (18 responses)
- Strongly Agree: 53% (23 responses)

Mean: 3.49  Standard Deviation: 0.59

13. Working with tutors helped me identify weaknesses and strengths in my study skills.

- Strongly Disagree: 0% (0 responses)
- Disagree: 7% (3 responses)
- Agree: 53% (23 responses)
- Strongly Agree: 40% (17 responses)

Mean: 3.33  Standard Deviation: 0.61
15. Tutoring has helped me to improve my grades at College of Marin.

1. Strongly Disagree 0 0%
2. Disagree 4 9%
3. Agree 19 44%
4. Strongly Agree 20 47%
Total Responses: 43
Mean: 3.37  Standard Deviation: 0.66

17. I feel comfortable asking for help in the Tutoring Center.

1. Strongly Disagree 0 0%
2. Disagree 2 5%
3. Agree 21 49%
4. Strongly Agree 20 47%
Total Responses: 43
Mean: 3.42  Standard Deviation: 0.59